

21. Fayyaz, Ebrahim and Abdullah Bejranlou (2017) Iranian National Cinema, Anthropological Approach, Tehran, Surah Mehr.
22. Kasierer, Ernst, (1991) Philosophy of Enlightenment, Yadollah Soghan, Tehran, Niloufar Publication.
23. Kissinger, Ellen (2007) Understanding the film, Bahman Taheri, 3rd edition, Tehran, Cheshmeh.
24. Grant, Damien, (2006), Realism, Hasan Afshar translation, Markaz publication, Tehran.
25. Vazinpour, Nader (2001), On Horse of words, Foroughi Publications, Tehran
26. Edwards Paul, The Encyclopedia of philosophy, New York, Macmillan, 1967, IV.
27. Corliss Lamont(1997) . The Philosophy of Humanism . eighth edition. Humanist Press . AMHERST, NEW YORK.

AN APPROACH TO THE COMPARATIVE PATTERNS AND FRAMEWORKS IN THE EUROPEAN TRAVELOGUES OF THE QAJAR ERA

Abdollah Motevalli,

PhD, Associate professor, History Department, Arak University, a.motevaly@gmail.com

Farhad Saboorifar,

PhD, Assistant professor, History Department, Arak University. f.saboorifar@gmail.com

Abstract. Travelogues are valuable historical resources communicating a significant part of the information neglected by other historical sources through a different approach and in a specific way. During Qajar era, due to the ties between Iran and Europe, some considerable travelogues were created, a vast part of which revealing various aspects of the Persian society as well as some developments within it. Along with these lines, the comparison and equalization could be observed between the Persian and the European civilizations. Sometimes the travelers compared and assessed the two explicitly. The present study aims to explore and analyze some dimensions of the explicit comparisons so that beyond the assessment of the Persian society during the Qajar era, some developments could be investigated and also apart from internal resources, the causes why some aspects of civilization in the two regions differed may be decoded. As such, the study tries to answer the questions as to which aspects of civilization had been subject to the comparison and assessment of the travelers, and also whether their images of Persia during the Qajar era could be a reasonable measure for the comparison.

Keywords: Qajar, Travelogue, Europeans, Comparative Frameworks.

Introduction. The course of developments in Persia from the Safavids toward the Qajar era has not been evolutionary. Despite the extensive developments emerging in Europe thanks to modernity, the Persian society experienced the opposite trend. Various dimensions of society instead of an onward movement were paralyzed by the political risks arising from the functions of the state elites as well as other factors. Thus, they were concerned about protecting their lives rather than developing a new design and a new course.

In addition, it seems that the behavior of the Persians in the era has been mostly affected by the way the governors took decisions and treat. Then it would be irrational to consider the social context as the origin for the formation of the next developments. The course of events confirmed that the political state had no such thinking context realizing the causes of a disquiet Persian society. Also, the dynamics of some intellectual and practical growth which at some point appeared occasionally would be quickly suppressed by authoritarian elements. Therefore the Persian society was not able to experience a favorable advancement in the civilizational dimensions. So a vast and irreparable gap was emerged in the intellectual and technical fields between the West and Persia during the Qajar era with an increasingly obvious aspects.

The present study is to explore the course of developments through a different approach. In doing so, some European travelogues during the Qajar era with a western civilization perspective on the Persian society have been selected in order to investigate their points of view. While the data within them might be offered for a particular purpose or might give a partial image of a real Persia due to the short stay of their authors, a considerable amount of which could cover some realities of the then Persia.

It should be noted that although the travelogues are not the same as to the volume of the comparison between Persia and West, given their precision regarding the different social dimensions most of them have sometimes taken a comparative attitude on the basis of settings and tried to admire or criticize. Their reactions may be a good suggestion as to the civilizational distance between Persia and the West in that era and whether it had been such that realized their particular reactions and positions. What were the effective factors contributing to the Persian developments from their perspectives?

Western developments in recent centuries at a glance. The West seemed to have no considerable scientific and technical advancements before the “Age of Discovery”. This significant increasingly growing event of the early 16th century brought desirable outcomes for the Europeans. Geographic explorations opened the horizons and set the stage

for change in Europe (Latifi 1387: 238). In fact, the process made the westerners richer and introduced preliminaries for growth in technical areas (Little 1387: 3). Such scientific patterns as mathematics, astronomy, chemistry, and medicine grew rapidly (Toynbee 1368: 646). By the 19th century Europe influenced by innovations and inventions had been changed thoroughly and the developments made fast pace with theoretical knowledge offering its achievements directly to the production cycle (Mallet and Isaac 1340: 738). Obviously, industrial speed played a vital role in the European development. Train and railway was a useful technology insuring the Europeans' growth (Wells 1366: 108/2). Steam engine especially in the vessels set the stage for them to speed up their progress (Palmer 1386: 171/1). Therefore, what is to be sought after in the study is the type of comparison the European travelers has made during the Qajar era regarding their mentality about scientific and technical levels of their own society.

Production factors and industrial and cultural areas. Industrial status of Persia during the Qajar era had a special position in the European traveler's mind. Perhaps the industrial circumstance of Europe as well as their concerns on the one hand, and their pride for European identity on the other made it important from different aspects in some of their notes.

Among the patterns suggesting the economic move and progress in a society is its productive industries and techniques and tools related to them. Any society in proportion to its era had employed some production tools and industries in various forms and at the same time, tried to gain skills in order to use the tools. However what is important may be how to focus on these areas to promote the industries both quantitatively and qualitatively and also deepen the general skills. The travelogues suggest the basic notion that Persia during the Qajar era was in a regressive status regarding its technical and industrial dynamism. Some compared manifestations reveals great gaps with the West. In a general interpretation which is not without European industrial atmosphere and from their knowledge, it may be elicited that there was a deep gap between Persia and Europe in this era regarding industry and skills. Some data suggests explicitly the failure of Persian industries and technical skills (Orsolle 1382: 312).

What can be achieved from the overall estimates of most of the travelers is the emphasis on technical and industrial backwardness in Persia during the Qajar era against Europe. Despite some minor developments in techniques and industries, their general conclusion has emphasized the significant notion that Persia had not experienced a progressive and proportionate movement in the industrial area and more importantly, suffered from a reverse process. As Wishard writes "it is wonderful that there is no knitting factory in Persia. Given the mountains with lots of water and potential force, such facilities have been neglected" (Wishard 1363: 271). Olivier¹ among the first Europeans visiting Persia during the Qajar era mentions explicitly the poor industrial circumstances of the nation as it had failed to develop (Olivier 1371: 170). Of course he attributes the gap to the internal riots after the Safavids and believes that if ties with the West since the Safavids went on, Persia would certainly progress as Europe (ibid: 171). He also writes that Persia had the capacity to develop toward civilization, yet this goal needed effective leaders (ibid: 154).

Another European traveler visiting Persia during the Qajar era, Polak² has offered a clearer image from the regressive technical and industrial course in Persia in spite of its increasing growth in Europe. "Since two centuries ago when Chardin came to Persia there has been no development in Persian industry" Polak writes "and even the situation has become worse" (Polak 1368: 379). Serena³ like other travelers assumes the situation of industries in Persia to experience a serious decline, believing that Persian assets could not compete with those of the Europeans (Serena 1362: 283). Flandin⁴, a traveler visiting Kashan during the reign of Mohammad Shah Qajar reveals regretfully the situation as the following: "While there are still factories working, one might be sad because of their vast majority being vacant. It is unfortunate for the first industrial town of the Safavids which has lost its status" (Flandin 2536: 125).

Such assertions imply that comes on European analogies with regard to the past, especially the Safavid period has become obvious. At that time, a more reasonable proportions were made, but the Qajar period does not show the proportion and the Persian technical products are not competitive with the European commercial products and tools (Brugsch⁵ 1367: 394/2). Of course with an estimate of sociological and historical nature, some of these travelers have commented optimistically about the future of Persian society. They believed that due to a good background of Persians concerning techniques and skills, they could promote industries if the circumstances allowed. As Polak writes "If the industry grows in Persia, not only there will be no imports from Europe but also it is not unlikely that Iranian goods in the markets of Europe to successfully compete with others" (Polak 1368: 11; see also 391). Reviewing the past times of

¹ Olivier was the French government's representative in Persia for political and commercial relations between the two countries during Agha Mohammad Khan's reign. His itinerary contains useful information about the situation in Persia during the early years of the Qajar, Bayat 1377: 336.

² Edward Jacob Pollack, Academy School Austrian teacher of Dar Al-Fonun and dedicated physician to Nasser Al-Din Shah. He was fluent in Persian. His famous book "*Iran and iranians*" contains useful information about the early years of the reign of Nasser Al-Din Shah. Bayat 1377: 338.

³ Carla Serena visited different parts of Persia in the reign of Nasser Al-Din Shah in 1877. Her travelogue with 56 chapters became later a historical resource and has been cited by many writers and Orientalists. Serena has provided valuable direct political, economic and social information about this era –Torkamani-Azar, 1378: 99.

⁴ The famous French traveler, Eugene Flandin had been appointed as the painter in the political staff in the court of Muhammad Shah. He traveled to different cities of Persia in the years 1840-1841 and formulated his observations in 56 chapters–Torkamani-Azar, 1378: 89.

⁵ The German traveler who came to Iran in 1859 along with members of the German Embassy. He had been visiting almost all the cities of Persia for three years and provided valuable knowledge about its political, economic and social aspects–Torkamani-Azar, 1378: 101.

Persia probably the Safavid period, Gobineau⁶ admires the textile and metal industries and believes that if internal destructive causes were removed, such industries could return to their brilliant past (Gobineau 1367: 366). In brief, the data contained in the above resources regarding the causes of Persian failure to progress in technical areas consider the state and lack of effective and capable leaders as the main factors contributing to hinder the progress instead of facilitating the optimal contexts for that goal.

Knowledge and intellectual and educational factors. One of the issues being the focus of European travelers during the Qajar era, is the level of the knowledge-orientedness of the Persians compared with that of the West. Of these writings one is sometimes faced with cases with a comparative approach.

In evaluating and comparing the views of European travelers in Safavid and Qajar periods it seems that the latter -regardless of educational methods- suggest a more serious gap regarding awareness and knowledge in the Persian society in comparison to that of Europe. Almost all of the criticism raised about awareness and knowledge in the Safavid era are present in the Qajar period with a higher profile. The neglect and inattention of the Persian society about innovations and inventions realized in the West can be seen as a serious drawback (Brugsch 1367: 566/2). In Polak's view, the inattention may be rooted in the Persian scientific pride (Polak 1368: 204). Lack of educational infrastructure as one of the causes of backwardness during the Qajar is another obvious issues having been focused on. Benjamin writes that there were many painters who work on portraits in Tehran, yet there is no special painting school for the painters. Given such talents, the school would compete with art schools of London and Paris (Benjamin 1363: 252).

Among the most notable accounts of the travelers as the factors for the failure to scientific progress in Persia during the Qajar era are lack of mass media as well as absence of knowledge promotion tools. Lack of newspaper and failure of the Persians to access the media in comparison with the Europeans has been one of the main obstacles to knowledge promotion. Dieulafoy⁷ believes that due to absence of postal service, a vast majority of Persians are deprived of Persian and Arabic newspapers, hence Persians have no knowledge about the civilized world (Dieulafoy 1361: 485).

Serena's view to the category of the press and their impact has been presented with a different perspective. She asserts that although there were some papers and journalists in Tehran, no one really care about the media. At the same time she admires the Europeans for the promotion of the press as a power factor supporting progress and civilization (Serena 1362: 157).

Another issue attracting the attention of European travelers regarding the non-proliferation of knowledge was a neglect to publish books in Persia during the Qajar era. Citing the lack of the Persian's interest in the press, Polak sees the great interest in manuscripts as a major obstacle to the printing industry in Persia (Polak 1368: 193-194).

Medical science due to its close ties with various social layers and at the same time the public need, was more likely to be evaluated. What the European travelers of the era suggest is a serious lack of development and progress in this area. Dieulafoy believes that Persian physicians have not studied anatomy and are not familiar with body organs (Dieulafoy 1361: 426). Mentioning the vast developments of medical science in the West, Polak emphasizes that the Persian medicine is based on the traditional and ancient criteria (Polak 1368: 397). Considering the very limited number of physicians in Tehran, Benjamin⁸ criticizes the health condition of Tehran as saying that his own hometown in the US, being the same size as Tehran, has about 600 physicians in addition to a health office and an excellent water piping system. Yet there was no such system in Tehran and people were still keeping water in open pits (Benjamin 1363: 228).

Also it appears that just like the Safavid era, belief in astronomy and superstitions was still in place, but without any development and progress. Dieulafoy is proud of the European society when he writes that fortune telling and superstitions has left the West and taken refuge in the East (Dieulafoy 1361: 77). This may be a manifestation of the European critical approach to the negative aspects of astronomy, being limited to fortune telling at that time, hence determinism. In this regard Polak likens Persia to the middle ages in Europe (Polak 1368: 198). It can be inferred that reduction of astronomy to fortune telling has been assumed as one of factors contributing to the backwardness of the East, especially Persia and the progress of European civilization has been attributed to its abandon.

Urban structures and construction areas. Urban structures, streets, squares and state structures were among things of interest to European travelers during the Qajar era. Basically, urban landscapes could be seen a symbol of performance and thinking of the government and society on the one hand, and a symbol of civilization on the other (see Habibi 1386: 40-41; 108 and 159). In this respect, urban structures can affect the mentality and make any observer compare and evaluate their homeland structures with them. That is why the majority of travelers have considered this notion directly, and therefore dedicated a part of their writings to that.

In the meantime, what has been obvious in many travelogues of the Safavid period is the admiration and wonder of the writers which has become sometimes exciting. It was due to the descriptions of such travelers from Isfahan that the European visitors of Persia during the Qajar era were eager to see this city in order to enjoy the beauties they had heard about. However it seems no room had been left for the glory of the city during the Qajar era for the travelers to compare it with Europe's magnificent cities (Brown 1371: 204). Visiting Isfahan in the early days of Fat'h Ali Shah's reign, Hallingbury writes that Isfahan once the capital city of the Safavids and as populated as large cities of

⁶ The French orientalist, scholar and politician, Joseph Arthur de Gobineau (1816 - 1882) with the famous race theory. He was a member of the French Foreign Ministry and a member of the embassy in various countries including Persia. He visited Persia twice (between 1855 and 1858) and wrote some books about it Bayat, 1377: 340.

⁷ The French archeologist, Dieulafoy visited Persia for three times to study ancient Persia. His writing about Persia is consisted of the notes and diaries which is of use for the study of Persian status – Bayat, 1377: 339.

⁸ The first US ambassador to Persia in 1882-1883 whose travelogue has 17 chapters- Torkamani-Azar, 1378: 16.

Asia and Europe, has lost its magnificence and become deserted (Hallingbury 1363: 59). Brugsch having a heaven-like image of Isfahan, depicts a different picture of the city (1367: 213/2). Yet after he had visited the city and some structures remaining from the Safavid era he admitted that there was no building in whole Europe with so magnificence as the school of the king's mother⁹ (ibid: 258).

Serena visited the square Naghsh-e Jahan and despite referring to the destruction of the buildings, praised the Persian architectures. She believes that the square in its time had no counterpart even in Europe (Serena 1362: 218). She also sarcastically addresses Nasser Al-Din Shah or his son¹⁰ by saying that the building has resisted destruction in which the king is interested (ibid).

This famous European traveler is apparently so impressed by the architecture of the square that raises such a thought-provoking question if the architects' souls of the Roman Empire had reincarnated in the architects of Isfahan (ibid). Being regretful for the ruins of Isfahan, Olivier comparatively believes that there is nothing in his home as great as the square Naghsh-e Jahan. He reluctantly considers Chahar-Bagh much better than the excellent streets of his own country (Olivier 1371: 114). Visiting Isfahan during the Qajar era, Gobineau mentions the then recession of urban structures in comparison to the Safavid era by admiring Persian taste and its revival within 50 years (Gobineau 1367: 206). Urban organization of Persia during the Qajar era has to some extent been the focus of the European travelers. Such travelers as Polak does not see urban organization of Persia positively. For example he compares the European capitals with Tehran and come to conclusion that as for Tehran no capital city characteristics is present (Polak 1368: 60). However some European visitors of Tehran were excited and introduced it as greater than the European capital cities (Frazer 1364: 219; Christensen 1385: 86; Brown 1371: 100).

As for the roads and places such as inns, there can be seen some cases of comparisons made by the travelers. Comparing the travels in Persia and the US, Wishard assumes a 200 mile travel in the US as a short nap but a difficult and demanding task due to lack of modern transportation (Wishard 1363: 131). This suggests that not only no step was taken during the Qajar era regarding the roads and places, but also vast destruction occurred because of lack of attention. Visiting Persia during Nasser Al-Din Shah, Dieulafoy admires the Shah Abbasi inns yet considers them to be ineffective and deserted (Dieulafoy 1361: 361).

In this regard, Polak admires the Safavids and criticizes the Qajars as neglecting the repair or construction of roads (Polak 1368: 301). This is why Gobineau reports that there is basically no roads in Persia (1367: 243) and Serena sees no roads suitable for carriage (1362: 28). De kuts Boe¹¹ who traveled from Caucasus to Persia asserts that Persians had not seen carriages and roads are some paths with no grass (De kuts Boe 1365: 138). Grothe criticizes the road maintenance in Persia and assumes it to be too far from Europe (Grothe 1369: 136) and Orsolle considers the line of communications in Persia as ineffective (Orsolle 1382: 310).

Reasons for civilization decline. A general understanding may be extracted from the European travelers: there have been considerable cases to be compared and evaluated in many social respects. On the other hand, they may suggest verities due to different products of Persia and those of Europe, being the latter superior. This could be a symbol for the European excellence and leadership in various aspects of civilization. There is no sign of admiration for the Safavid civilization and in fact, Persian thought, skill and knowledge.

The general trend of Persian society during the Qajar era was in a phase of decline¹². The travelogues clearly reveal that by that time, the gap between Persian and European civilizations became large and many desirable patterns of the Safavid era became obsolete. The period is characterized by lack of effort to revive or maintain the Persian civilization and identity. These are obvious in the travelogues. In addition, the travelers go on to compare the two eras (Safavid and Qajar) and mention the decline of Persian society during the Qajar era in technical and scientific areas which is present in their description of buildings, urban spaces, roads, artistic works, and products especially textile.

It is interesting that some of these travelers sometimes try to discuss the pathology and analyze the factors contributed to the decline. Above all, the improper ruling has been introduced as the main cause of the decline (Brown 1371: 99). Frazer¹³ defines agriculture and commerce as poor and accuses the royal family as the most harmful individuals for their nation who have no counterpart in other nations and eras (Frazer 1364: 86). Having the most prominent viewpoints in this regard, Polak admires Shah Abbas and considers the Qajars and specifically Nasser Al-Din Shah as unable to utilize the production power (see Polak 1368: 301). Serena mentions the national issues and the need for a powerful leader to restore the civilization and introduces Nasser Al-Din Shah as unable to carry out the task (Serena 1362: 83).

⁹ The school of the king's mother or Chahar Bagh in Isfahan was constructed during the reign of Shah Soltan Hussein of Safavid dynasty- Kiyani, 1385: 111.

¹⁰ Brugsch believes that Qajar rulers did not restore the city, but even destroyed some buildings because of their interests -1367: 368. Other historical evidence and documents confirm the account as well.

¹¹ Russian traveler, De kuts Boe traveled to Persia in 1817. Visiting some northern parts of Persia and giving some accounts of Persian political, economic, and social condition, he met the prince crown, Abbas Mirza and other court men. His book has been organized in 30 chapters- Torkamani-Azar, 1378: 124.

¹² It is not surprising that the then most pivotal concern of the thinkers is to decode the causes of decline and backwardness of the Persian society and to suggest ways out of such situations.

¹³ The British political agent during the reign of Fat'h Ali Shah and Mohammad Shah who traveled to Persia. After visiting different parts of Persia, he displayed its social situation. He also met with senior Persian officials-Torkamani-Azar, 1378: 96.

Additionally, Gobineau assumes despotism and state pressure on the people as a main factor for lack of investment and development in Persia (Gobineau 1367: 394) and believes that the Persian taste is still live and could be revive (ibid: 206). Emphasizing that Persia and its people used to be happy, Flandin assumes the root cause of the decline as the ruling elite of the Qajars¹⁴ (Flandin 2536: 420). The first US ambassador to Persia during the Qajar era, Benjamin has a different perspective and believes that the main cause of the Persian decline may be found in the external factors and Russia and UK, above all (Benjamin 1363: 307). Of course, his understanding is linked to the US challenges with the above mentioned states.

Conclusion. Since travelogues collect field studies and observations, they are a major source for the analysis of diverse pieces of information from different levels of society and can cover many varieties of information neglected in other historical resources. The vast majority of the historical resources of the era -under the influence of the dominant discourse- assume the political-military patterns. However the travelogues take a different approach and provide valuable information from other layers of society, increasing our social knowledge about the eras. Yet, being foreigner, short stay, non-familiarity with the indigenous culture, and probably some prejudices or interests among the travelers may have influenced on their views, hence the data in their writings may have contained some distortion, biasedness, and even contempt toward the Persians during the era. In spite of this, other information contained in the books cannot be ignored however¹⁵.

Due to increasing relations of Persia and Europe, the Safavid and Qajar eras provided the perfect arena for the countless European travelers and adventurers – thank to the conditions and developments of the West- to travel to the oriental lands. Some of them recorded their observations which set the stage for valuable information to appear for their nations. They seemed to compare the Persian society with their own and evaluate it under the influence of internal circumstances of their nation as well as Europe. Investigation of some travelogues showed that they were aware of the topic and apart from geographical and cultural characteristics, have compared the civilization patterns as well as technical and intellectual possessions of both Persia and Europe.

The final outcome of the investigation and in accordance with the questions posed at the beginning of the study it could be suggested that regardless of some prejudice, much of this comparative approach can be more clearly demonstrate the overall levels of Persian society in comparison with the European one. In the course of the Safavid compared to the Qajar era, another pattern may be found through the comparison and evaluation which is the backwardness of some civilizational and technical areas. Additionally, in the field of urban structures, not only no progress can be seen, but regression can be well received from these itineraries. What reflects this unfortunate trend is the fact that some of these travelers neglected the comparison between the two civilizations and were more focused on the comparison of the Qajar era with that of Safavid. Mentioning the capabilities of the Persian elements in reviving their developed civilization, they accused the ruling elite of the social backwardness. The available accounts confirm the Persian decline and backwardness from another perspective.

References

1. Bayat, A. (1377) *Shenasae-ye Manabe' va Ma'akhez-e Tarikh-e Iran*, , Tehran: Amirkabir.
2. Benjamin, S.J (1363). *Iran and Iranians*, trans. by Hossein Kordbache, Tehran: Javidan.
3. Brown, E. (1371). *A Year among the Persians*, trans. by Zabihollah Mansoori, Tehran: Kanoon-e Ma' refat.
4. Brugsch, H. (1367) *Safari be Darbar-e Soltan-e Saheb Gharan*, vol.II, trans. by Hossein Kordbache, Tehran: Ettela'at.
5. Christensen, A. (1385). *TransCaspian*, trans. by Manizhe Ahadzadegan and Ali Alfone, Tehran: Tahoori.
6. De Gobineau, A. (1367). *Trio Ans en Asie*, trans. by Abdolreza Hooshang mahdavi, Tehran: Ketabsara.
7. De Kuts Boe, M. (1365). *A Voyage to Persia*, trans. by Mahmood Hedayat, Tehran: Javidan.
8. Dieulafoy, J. (1361). *Travelogue*, trans. by Faravashi, Tehran: Khayyam.
9. Frazer, J.B. (1364). *A Winter Journey*, trans. by Manoochehr Amiri, Tehran: Toos.
10. Flandin, E. (2536). *Travelogue*, trans. by Hossein noor Sadeghi, Tehran: Eshraghi.
11. Grothe, H. (1369). *Travelogue*, trans. by Majid Jalilvand Hedayat, Tehran: Nasr-e Markaz.
12. Habibi, M. (1386). *Az Shar ta Shahr*, Tehran: Daneshgah-e Tehran.
13. Hallingburry, W. (1363). *Sir John Malcolm's Travel to Persia*, trans. by Amir Hooshang Amini, Tehran: Ketabsara.
14. Hosseini tababtaba'ee, M. (1375). *Naghd-e assar-e Khavarshenasan*, Tehran: Chapakhsh.
15. vKiyani, M.Y. (1385). *Tarikh-e Honar-e Me'mari-ye Iran dar Dore-ye Eslami*, Tehran: Samt.
16. Latifi, N. (1387). *Tarikh-e Tahavvolat-e orupa dar Gharn-e Jadid*, Tehran: Samt.
17. Mallet, A. and Jules Isaac (1340). *The History of the Middle Ages*, trans. by Abdolhossein Hazhir, Tehran: Ebn-e Sina.
18. Olivier, G.A. (1371). *Le Voyage dans l'Empire Othoman, l'Égypte et la Perse*, trans. by Mohammad Taher Mirza, edited by Gholamreza varahram, Tehran: Ettela'at.

¹⁴ Now Persia is going to decline due to a corrupt state – Flandin, 2536: 420.

¹⁵ See Hosseini Tabataba'ee, 1375: 7-10.

19. Orsolle, E. (1382). *Le Caucase Et La Perse*, trans. by Ali Asghar Saeedi, Tehran: pazhuheshgah-e Olum-e Ensani.
20. Palmer, R.R. (1386). *A History of a Modern World*, vol.I, trans. by Abolghassem Taheri, Tehran: Amirkabir.
21. Polak, J.E. (1368) *Das Postwesen in Persien*, trans. by Keykavoos Jahandari, Tehran: Kharazmi.
22. Serena, C. (1362). *Hommes Et Choses En Perse*, trans. by Ali Asghar Saeedi, Tehran: Zavvar.
23. Torkamani Azar. P. (1387). *Ketabshenasi-ye Gozide-ye Tosifi Tarikh Iran Dore-ye Eslami*, Tehran: Samt
24. Toynbee, A. (1368). *A Study of History*, vol III, trans. by Ya'ghub Azhand, Tehran: Mola.
25. Wells, H.G. (1366). *A Short History of the World*, trans. by Mas'ood Rajabniya, Tehran: Soroush.
26. Wilson littlefield, H. (1387). *New Outline History of Europe: 1815-1944*, trans. by Fereydoon Gharachedaghi, Tehran: Elmi va Farhangi.
27. Wishard. J. (1363). *Twenty Years in Persia*, trans. by Ali Pirniya, Tehran: Zarrin.

DIALECTIC OF ETHNIC IDENTITY AND CLASS: COEXISTENCE OR CONFLICT?

Mohammad Reza Naeimi,

PhD of sociology and Faculty Member, Islamic Azad University, Azadshahr Branch

Abstract. The study aimed to investigate coexistence or conflict between ethnic and class identity, the subjects to the study were 400 chosen from Turkmen, Turk and Sistani people aged 15-29 in Gonbad Kavvoos City due to the ethnic scattering and socioeconomic structure. First, the conceptual study on ethnic and class identity, pervious research and George Herbert Mead's theory has been done. Then, assuming impact of socialization on identity construction, the coordination between family, school and university for the purpose of formation of ethnic and class identity was investigated. Both objective and subjective ethnic identity and class identification in the two forms of traditional and modern were investigated. Result showed that only objective ethnic identity and class identification in its modern form have had conflicting interaction among university students. However, the subjects have had peaceful coexistence in other dimensions. It should be said that there was a lack of coordination between university, school and family in the transmission of values and patterns.

Key words: Identity, Ethnic identity, class identity, socialization.

Statement of the issue. The issue is human identity in terms of vital, objective and subjective concerns that truly reflects the position of human in the universe. The issue that created questions such as: where did man come from? Where does he belong to? And where does he go? Answering these questions makes transition possible from the instinctive unconscious level to the collective unconscious level (kind). The power that causes unconscious transition from the instinctive level to the collective, is called evolution and man differ from other organisms according to the law of evolution that takes place in three field of his existence. The first field is related to human morphology that products hands upright and freedom; the evolution which leads to the elegance and ability to do things by human that other animals are incapable and helpless for doing so. The second field is evolution in physiology, the mechanism of acoustic elements of human, especially in parts of the larynx, will be able to resolute sounds and express words. Finally human neurologic is subject to evolution in order to multiple grooves in the brain and also releasing excess oxygen due to hands freedom. The outcome of such processes known as mind that is common for all human and it is distinguishing form between humans and animals. But the mind itself is devoid of any discrimination power and only in the face of the outside world and external environment gets cover of discrimination power (Stiegler according to Gourhan, 1998, 143-146). Unity becomes diversity (the kind of human to individual) by encountering the mind with the outside world and the transition begins from the collective unconscious to the individual unconscious so that human identity is formed (Ritzer, 1989, 296). Thus the identity is Individuality at the first step; Individuality which reflects images and subjective perception in itself when facing the universe and on this occasion can find multiple identities among people who live in the same geographical and historical region. On this basis, identity was not fixed and eternal issue but construct according to the knowledge which mind brings it from the outside world.

In traditional and pre-modern societies, identity was not so complex and problematic issue. There were not fundamental differences and identity crisis was not a matter; because when the people mind face with the outside world, they mostly realize the world with basic and common feature, and identity differences found as differences in symptoms not in nature (Tomlinson, 2003, 269). Nowadays, the man's identity is complex, multi-center and plural so we are facing with identity pluralism both at the society macro level and within each different people and also within each identity. Everyone identity has varieties and levels of belonging. In other words, there are a variety of identity sources which exists all together in identity scheme. Every individual naturally is placed among the several belonging in which each of them is seated to "human himself" and it has been institutionalized; of course, this situation will change according to time and place. Due to the influence of collective identity sources and the proliferation of identity dimensions, any unilateral approach that makes any of collective identity dimensions prominent and influential, can cause disruption for